

CARSPHAIRN COMMUNITY COUNCIL

Minute of meeting held at 7.00pm on 25th September 2017 in Lagwyne Hall

Present:

Elected Members:

Liz Holmes (Chair)	Sylvia Sinclair (Vice Chair)	Matt Hickman (Minutes)
Simon Holmes	Andrew Metcalf	Anna Clark Kennedy (Secretary)

In Attendance:

Martin Temple	Darren Challis (Treasurer)	David McMillan
Cllr Jane Maitland	Doreen Rennie	PC John Brown (part)
Clare Duggleby	Steve Cowley	Jane Evans
Arnold Duggleby	Fiona Clubb	Ruth Williams
Lloyd Evans	Christine Whigg	Justin Reid
PC Chloe Ellis (part)	Peter Seed	

1. Welcome and Apologies.

LH Welcomed all to the meeting.

Apologies received from Cllr Dougie Campbell and Cllr Patsy Gilroy.

2. Declarations of Interest.

None

3. Approval of Minutes of meeting 28th August 2017.

The minutes were approved.

Proposed ACK, Seconded LH.

4. Treasurer's Report.

Attached.

5. Police Report.

Nothing to report

6. D&G Councillor's Report.

Cllr Maitland drew the meeting's attention to the community safety day of action on October the 4th.

7. Cornharrow Windfarm.

Justin Reid of Energiekontor UK introduced himself and the proposed Cornharrow windfarm that is presently going through the scoping process. The report was submitted to DGC in June; there has not yet been any response.

The site is 11 KM from Carsphairn on the B729; it is thought capable of accommodating up to 13 of 158M turbines with a rated capacity of up to 36MW. There is a community benefit fund of £5000 per MW of rated capacity. The site was originally identified from the Landscape Capacity Study, the developer feels that the minimal separation distances from other windfarms including Wetherhill suits the creation of a cluster, though with so many other projects in the pipeline it is acknowledged that saturation will be reached at some point. The implications of other developments must be taken into account. There are 2 residential properties within 1KM and 1 within 2KM. The developer is aware of the issues this presents and will attempt to mitigate.

There will be a public exhibition in a month with another planned for early next year. It is expected that a planning application will be submitted by April 2018. The CC will be kept informed of progress.

Concerns were raised from the floor regarding the grid connection and whether yet another pylon line would be required. JR explained that they have applied to SPEN and secured a connection "in principle" that will run south east towards Dumfries.

A discussion was held regarding business rates which appear to be received by the Scottish Government and distributed to local councils. JM stressed that, as with the benefit fund, this was not a material consideration to the planning process.

FC asked why this site had been considered suitable for development. JR explained that it was identified from the LCS and following a site visit. It was also not in a national park or scenic area.

Regrets were expressed by the meeting at the demolition of Trostan farm house and the possibility that Cornharrow house may become uninhabitable. It was felt by the meeting that the cumulative impacts of windfarms reducing the community's housing stock undermines our hopes for the future.

8. Matters Arising From Minutes of Meeting 28th August

a/ Raynet.

Deferred until Trevor Molinoux is able to contribute.

b/ U712 Road Repair.

On-going.

c/ CC Scheme of Establishment.

On-going. It was agreed AM will attend the SCVS meeting on the 11th October and report back.

d/ Trapped Deer in Scottish Power Flume.

Agreed we will remain in contact with Scottish Power regarding this.

e/ Community Garden Lights

The connection is now made. The meeting thanked SS for her work in achieving this. AM and SC will now progress the trench to the garden.

f/ 20MPH MSP Bill

LH has responded to this and distributed a link for individual responses. The response deadline was extended to 15 September -a report will be compiled to inform first draft of the bill to be lodged with parliament asap. This may take some months owing to the scale of the responses.

g/ Flooding

We have not had adequate updating from DGC in time for the meeting. MH will draft an email to pursue the issue.

h/ B729 Verges and Ruts.

ACK has logged this with the roads department. JM advised it best to do it through the CCES so it has a reference number.

ACTION

ACK to log with CCES.

i/ Peat removal

A reply has been received from Scott Bennett at Natural Power explaining that the peat is being removed from the site of a substation associated with the Windy Standard 2 development at SEPA's insistence.

8. Windfarms.

a/ South Kyle.

This application has been approved by the ECU. Agreed we will invite a representative from the developer to the November meeting.

b/ Windy Rig.

The number of turbines has been reduced from 16 to 12. The Chair has signed the pre planning agreement. The developer hopes the planning decision will be determined at the November Planning Committee meeting.

c/ Benbrack.

To the consternation and disappointment of the meeting this application has been approved by the ECU. Agreed we will invite the developer to a future meeting.

d/ Trostan.

As the development adjoins Stroanshalloch windfarm in Dalry FC had attended Dalry CC meeting to discuss and inform them of the proposal. SH presented a report on behalf of CCC in response to the Trostan Loch scoping report.

ACTION

SH to email to ACK CCC's response to the scoping report to be submitted in time before the deadline of 30th September.

e/ Cornharrow

See Item 7 above.

ACTION

SH to read and comment on scoping report.

f/ Windfarm revenue

MH had done some updating of the comprehensive list originally produced by SS and advised that we now have 26 windfarms in various stages of development impacting on the community in one way or another, currently totalling exactly 500 turbines.

By multiplying the total rated capacity of all the combined windfarms with the current wholesale price of electricity at £50/MWH, the number of hours in a year (8760) and the number of years of operation (25) he came to a rough ball park figure of £15.5 billion in theoretical future revenue for developers. Allowing an estimated capacity factor of 40% a more realistic figure would be around £6,000,000,000 were all the proposals to be completed.

Regarding business rates it appears that the developers pay roughly double the benefit fund payment, but it is difficult to establish who receives the fund.

It is also noted that some County Councils in England are agreeing to a reduction in council tax following an acceptance that property values are reduced by windfarm developments in close proximity.

ACTION

ACK to make CCES enquiries to find out how business rates from windfarms are administrated and whether DGC will reduce council tax for properties close to windfarms.

G Awareness raising.

FC reported she had met with Finlay Carson MSP to discuss windfarms. At Government level it is considered that the community benefit fund mitigates any impacts from development. Also, that the NHS representative at Dalry CC meeting took on-board the potential impacts of stress on the wellbeing of a community subjected to this kind of sudden development.

She had bought a large map upon which to display windfarm developments.

ACTION

FC to deal with the map being located inside the hall following necessary permissions from the hall committee.

9. Resilience Group Report.

No report as TM not present.

MH advised that both issues regarding the drain under the access road to the Manse and the drains at Glendale had been reported to DGC and were in hand.

10. CCT Report.

Attached.

11. Planning Applications.

Nothing to report

12. Correspondence.

This had been distributed by the secretary.

13. AORB.

Seniors' Dinner – This needs thought and will be discussed at the next meeting. LH will get quotes from suitable caterers

Phone service up the Ken – PS and CW raised the issue of on-going phone faults in their area.

ACTION

ACK to contact Offcom and make a formal complaint.

Defibrillator – It was agreed the CC will pay the costs for electricity.

ACTION

SS to email Anne Rutherford to establish what action is needed regarding replacing the pads.

Wreath – AM expressed the opinion that the laying of the wreath on Remembrance Sunday should be open to anyone, not just previously serving members of the armed forces.

ACTION

ACK to contact individuals considered suitable.

Shop drain

It was reported that the drain taking the rainwater from the roof of the shop was blocked.

ACTION

ACK to report this via CCES.

The meeting closed at 9.50 pm

Date of next meeting – 30th October 2017.

Carsphairn Community Council

Treasurer's Report for September 2017

Community Council General Transactions and Balance

<u>Payment Details</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Paid Out</u>	<u>Paid in</u>	<u>Balance</u>
<i>Brought Forward</i>				£2,270.80
No Transactions				£2,270.80
Community Council Balance				£2,270.80

Ring-fenced Transactions and Balances for Funded Projects:

Community Garden Electric Light Connection (CREFL)

<u>Payment Details</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Paid Out</u>	<u>Paid in</u>	<u>Balance</u>
<i>Brought Forward</i>				£1,500.00
No Transactions				£1,500.00
Balance				£1,500.00

Community Garden (CREFL)

<u>Payment Details</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Paid Out</u>	<u>Paid in</u>	<u>Balance</u>
<i>Brought Forward</i>				£220.54
Martin Temple	Maintenance	363.80	0.00	-£143.26
CREFL	Grant	0.00	500.00	£356.74
Balance				£356.74

Resilience Group (Fund Raising)

<u>Payment Details</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Paid Out</u>	<u>Paid in</u>	<u>Balance</u>
<i>Brought Forward</i>				£5.63
No Transactions				£5.63
Balance				£5.63

Resilience Group Equipment (CREFL / Stewartry Area Committee)

<u>Payment Details</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Paid Out</u>	<u>Paid in</u>	<u>Balance</u>
<i>Brought Forward</i>				£2,697.00
Trevor Molineux	Shed Base	119.28	0.00	£2,697.00
Anne Rutherford	Shed	1349.00	0.00	£1,348.00
Balance				£1,228.72

Resilience Group Defibrillator (CREFL)

<u>Payment Details</u>	<u>Description</u>	<u>Paid Out</u>	<u>Paid in</u>	<u>Balance</u>
<i>Brought Forward</i>				£500.00
No Transactions				£500.00
Balance				£500.00

Ring-fenced Balance **£3,591.09**

Bank Account Balance as at start of day 25th September **£5,861.89**

TROSTAN LOCH WIND FARM - SCOPING REPORT June 2017

Carsphairn Community Council's Comments on the Report 29 September 2017

As consultees of the Trostan Windfarm Scoping Report Carsphairn Community Council is not willing or able to answer all the questions as requested. Have read all the fifteen sections of this exhaustive report it is clear to us that much of the content assessments and data is too specialized for any other than professionals in a number of scientific disciplines to make useful or constructive comment on the process. For that reason our response is to answer only those 'questions' that appear to be of direct relevance to community wellbeing. Our lack of response to all other 'key questions to consultees' should not be taken to indicate approval of any given content or assessment methodology, nor lack of knowledge or potential input with respect to additional data and consultees.

Our comments below are restricted to Section 3. Environmental Impact Assessment, Section 5. Landscape & Visual Impact Assessment, Section 6. Archaeology and Cultural Heritage, and Section 13. Socio-Economics, Recreation & Tourism.

3 ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT

3.1 Scope of the EIA

The eleven listed assessment areas of the Scoping report do not include the all important area of cumulative impact, which overreaching and complex consideration Carsphairn Community Council request should constitute an additional 16TH bulleted item placed ahead of the last bulleted item [no 15 'other issues']

3.2.2 Mitigation

As above, the additional footnote does not specify what kind of 'enhancement measures' are proposed other than the 'removal of turbines'. More serious consideration should be given to the integration of turbines as a tool of landscape design. eg. repair of footpaths, creative signage and interpretative fixtures and features.

3.2.4 Cumulative Effects

This Scoping report appears to sidestep the important issue of potentially adverse cumulative impact. The statement "Cumulative effects, which are the combined effects of two or more similar developments, will be considered for each technical area assessed within the EIA" is not only ambiguous, but too narrow and brief. Unless the whole subject is taken more seriously the prospect of windfarm saturation will continue to impact on the socio-economic welfare of the local community. [Note CCC proposed 3.1 amendment]

5. LANDSCAPE & VISUAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT

5.4.1 Site Context

EDF should take note that the demolition of Trostan farmhouse was contrary to both Carsphairn and Glenkens stated policy of rural regeneration and responsible environmental/heritage stewardship. That this at least 'late medieval' fermtoun site retains its status as a potential residential building site should certainly constitute a baseline Scoping condition. Whether managed by the developer, or sold on the open market the property should not be rendered uninhabitable by close proximity to turbines.

5.4.4 Cumulative

Existing and proposed revues of the cumulative wind farm sites within 60 km search area are too broad a desk top exercise. They do not constitute a meaningful Scoping appraisal of the potential that multi company saturation windfarm development has to degrade the working, recreational and domestic landscape of small often isolated communities. [Note CCC proposed 3.1 amendment]

5.5.3 Cumulative

While the assertion that "Cumulative effects arise where the study areas for two or more wind farms overlap" & etc repeats the obvious, the concluding statement that "wind farms are not generally included in the detailed cumulative assessment" can only be described as both disingenuous and dismissive. [Note proposed amendment]

5.6 Key Questions for Consultees

- Do consultees agree with the identified landscape receptors to be included within the LVIA? 'Receptors' should include every occupied or potentially habitable dwelling

- Do consultees agree with the approach to the cumulative assessment? Feedback and agreement on the cumulative wind farms to be assessed in detail in the LVIA is requested from consultees.

Note CCC proposed 3.1 amendment

- Are there any other relevant consultees who should be contacted with respect to the LVIA? Every resident within at least a 20 km radius of Trostan Loch should be consulted on an individual basis.

5.5.7 Consultation

'Wider consultation' should include specific reference to local residents

6 ARCHAEOLOGY AND CULTURAL HERITAGE

6.5 Key Questions for Consultees

- Do the consultees agree with the proposed methodology and scope of assessment?

The simple answer to both the above questions is that we do not. Not only is the methodology restrictive, but the scope is far too narrow. The area is rich in largely unrecorded, unsurveyed sites of varying degrees of local and national importance.

- Do consultees have any information regarding current or recent archaeological work or projects being undertaken within or in the vicinity of the Development site, particularly those whose results may not yet be recorded in the National Monuments Record for Scotland? Carsphairn Community Council are aware of at least one local archaeological project in current progress in the Parish area which although supported by the D&G archaeology department is not referred to anywhere in this Scoping.

Simon Holmes is currently researching and cataloguing local archaeological/heritage sites in the area.

- Are the consultees aware of any further sites with statutory protection within the wider landscape whose settings may be affected by the Development?

See previous point

- Do the consultees have details of any cultural heritage sites in the vicinity of the Development site which it considers may raise significant issues within the EIA process for this Development?

On the basis of local knowledge relating to the archaeology and history of Glenkens, Trostan Farm and its surroundings constitute a site that raises significant issues [note Carsphairn Community Council comments above]

13. SOCIO-ECONOMICS

13.5 Key Questions for Consultees

This section is not only woefully brief, it fails to address two important issues. One an already observable depression of property values that can be directly linked to current and proposed windfarm development in the area, a downward spiral looks set to deepen and continue. And two, in light of the sad demise of the hill farming economy the importance of expanding the local tourist industry in the future. .

- Are Consultees aware of any key sensitive receptors that should be taken into account?

The local tourist industry, both as it stands today and its potential for future growth depends on local people taking up the challenge including the following initiatives - holiday accommodation, campsites, eco-tourism and field events. Windfarm development in the district that results in 'no go zones' for visitors should be either re-designed or abandoned

- Are Consultees aware of any additional relevant consultees?

As stated above, all residents within at least a 20 km radius of Trostan Loch should be consulted on an individual basis, both to assure them that their views will be taken into account and as a useful planning exercise in itself. Working together EDF and the local community can take active steps both to create economic growth and to enhance the visitor experience, to the benefit of all parties.

Carsphairn Community Trust

Report – September 2017

Muirdrochwood Project:

CCT have had a meeting with FES about larch disease in Muirdrochwood and FES are working on felling plans. This will need to be considered in any feasibility study relating to this Project. We expect to hear from SLF in mid October about funding for this study.

Recreation Group:

1. Photography for Fun – new block of 6 afternoon classes started on Tuesday 6th September. Last session of this block will be on 10th October.

2. Badminton - starts back on Tuesday 3rd October for 4 weeks. Everyone is very welcome! There is a wide range of abilities so you'll find a good match whether you're experienced or just starting out.

3. Yoga – continuing weekly with tea afterwards. The group are discussing having a day-long workshop.

4. Ladies' Night - November – date to be confirmed. Anne Ireland will be bringing a selection of Christmas Gifts from her shop in Dalmellington and showing us how to make a floral table decoration for Christmas.

5. New activities -

- **Art Class** – We are finalising dates and looking to start this autumn.
- **Table tennis** has been requested. Please get in touch if you're interested!
- **Canasta** – does anybody play and would you like us to organise games in the hall? Please let us know.

Updates will be put on the community website and notice boards in the village.